

# Audit of Water Entitlement Purchases (GMW Connections)

Report

Prepared for Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning

10 September 2015



## Document Information

Prepared for Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning  
Project Name Audit of Water Entitlement Purchases (GMW Connections)  
Job Reference 3605-33  
Date 10 September 2015

## Contact Information

**Cardno (Qld) Pty Ltd**  
ABN 57 051 074 992

Level 11 Green Square  
515 St Paul's Terrace  
Fortitude Valley Qld 4006

Telephone: 07 3369 9822  
Facsimile: 07 3369 9722  
International: +61 7 3369 9822

[www.cardno.com.au](http://www.cardno.com.au)

## Document Control

Version	Date	Author	Author Initials	Reviewer	Reviewer Initials
Draft	27/08/2015	Stephen Walker Jo Buldeski	SVW JB	Stephen Walker	SVW
Final	10/09/2015	Stephen Walker Jo Buldeski	SVW JB	Stephen Walker	SVW

© Cardno 2015 Copyright in the whole and every part of this document belongs to Cardno and may not be used, sold, transferred, copied or reproduced in whole or in part in any manner or form or in or on any media to any person other than by agreement with Cardno.

This document is produced by Cardno solely for the benefit and use by the client in accordance with the terms of the engagement. Cardno does not and shall not assume any responsibility or liability whatsoever to any third party arising out of any use or reliance by any third party on the content of this document.

## Table of Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Background	1
1.2	Scope of audit	1
<b>2</b>	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>2</b>
2.1	Requirement for confirming Water Entitlement Entities (WEEs)	2
2.2	Methodology	2
<b>3</b>	<b>Results of reconciliation of WEEs claimed by GMW Connections against the Victorian Water Register</b>	<b>3</b>
3.1	Review of ownership evidence	6
<b>4</b>	<b>Calculation of long term diversion limit equivalent</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>9</b>
5.1	Observations	9
5.2	Recommendations	10

## Tables

Table 3-1	Results of initial reconciliation	3
Table 3-2	Investigation of observed variances between the Victorian Water Register and GMW records	4
Table 3-3	Insufficient Evidence of Ownership	7
Table 4-1	Calculation of Long Term Diversion Limit Equivalent	8

## Appendices

### Appendix A WEEs claimed by GMW

# 1 Introduction

## 1.1 Background

The Victorian State Government and the Commonwealth Government have committed significant funding for the renewal and modernisation of the Goulburn-Murray Irrigation District (GMID). The water savings achieved through the renewal and modernisation works are to be shared between the environment, and Melbourne and irrigation customers. The works are also expected to improve the efficiency of delivery and increase the level of service provided to irrigation customers.

Goulburn-Murray Water (GMW) is the owner and operator of the GMID. The GMW Connections Project forms the greater part of the modernisation of the Goulburn-Murray Irrigation District (GMID).

In previous annual audits of the water recovery achieved through modernisation, water savings due to purchase of Water Entitlement Entities (WEEs) have been audited alongside savings due to modernised infrastructure. For the 2014/15 audit, the Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning (DELWP) wished to audit water savings due to WEEs in advance of the remainder of the audit scope. The scope of works for this project is solely focused on the cumulative water entitlement purchases up to 30 June 2015 managed by GMW Connections, converted to average equivalent water recovery.

## 1.2 Scope of audit

The scope of work for the audit of the water entitlement purchases consists of:

- ▶ checking that the Water Entitlement Entity (WEE) information provided by GMW Connections aligns with that recorded in the Victorian Water Register at 30 June 2015. For this purpose, GMW Connections was required to provide a register of WEE details and supporting information.
- ▶ cross-checking the water register report from DELWP on all WEE numbers claimed by GMW Connections
- ▶ checking the calculations of Long Term Diversion Limit Equivalent (LTDLE) water recovery using the conversion factors provided by DELWP
- ▶ collecting evidence from GMW Connections of ownership for entitlements not in the name of GMW.

## 2 Methodology

### 2.1 Requirement for confirming Water Entitlement Entities (WEEs)

The audit scope requires that the ownership and details of the WEEs claimed by GMW Connections as being in its ownership at 30 June 2015 are to be confirmed. Specifically, the WEEs held by GMW Connections are to be cross-checked against the Victorian Water Register in the following respects:

- ▶ GMW Connections to provide a register of WEE details and supporting information detailing:
  - > Water Entitlement Entity (WEE) number;
  - > water entitlement volumes related to particular WEE number;
  - > date of transfer recorded in the Victorian Water Register (to be no later than 30 June 2015);
  - > classification of water entitlements as either high or low reliability;
  - > classification of water entitlements by river basin/irrigation area;
  - > evidence of ownership of entitlements whether in the name of GMW or otherwise;
  - > the project under which the entitlement was purchased; and
  - > any additional water entitlement purchase information requested by the Auditor.
- ▶ DELWP will provide a Water Register Report on all the WEE numbers claimed by GMW Connections.

The audit also requires the auditor to check the calculation of LTDLE water recovery as per the conversion factors detailed in the audit brief.

### 2.2 Methodology

To complete this requirement of the audit, we undertook the following activities:

1. Obtained a spreadsheet from GMW Connections detailing its WEE holdings and relevant information about the entitlements including WEE number and volume.
2. Provided the list of WEE numbers claimed by GMW to the DELWP, and requested them to provide the volume, reliability classification, date of transfer recorded on the register, and ownership details relating to each claimed WEE number.
3. Reconciled the details provided to us by DELWP from the Victorian Water Register against the schedule provided to us by GMW Connections. For WEEs claimed by GMW Connections where the Victorian Water Register confirmed the WEE details and that the entitlement was in GMW's ownership, we accepted this WEE for inclusion in the calculation of the LTDLE. Where we identified discrepancies between the two data sources we investigated further to establish the correct details.
4. For WEEs claimed by GMW Connections where the Victorian Water Register recorded the ownership of the WEE as being in the name of a party other than GMW we required GMW Connections to provide secondary evidence to confirm its ownership of the entitlement, such as a mortgage over the WEE, unless this has been sighted by Cardno during a previous audit.
5. For all WEEs confirmed as being in GMW's ownership, we applied the conversion factors to the WEE volumes to determine the LTDLE. These calculations are set out in Section 0.
6. Provided a draft report to GMW Connections and DELWP for checking for factual accuracy and acted on the feedback received to finalise this report.

### 3 Results of reconciliation of WEEs claimed by GMW Connections against the Victorian Water Register

Following reconciliation between GMW Connections' schedule of claimed WEEs and the Victorian Water Register, we were able to divide the Entities claimed by GMW Connections into the following categories:

- ▶ WEEs where the details were consistent with the Victorian Water Register and are registered in GMW's name
- ▶ WEEs where the details were consistent with the Victorian Water Register but are held in the name of others
- ▶ WEEs where there was a difference in the details recorded (in some instance on multiple fields) on the Victorian Water Register
- ▶ WEEs that are outside of the project area.

The volume of WEEs (high reliability, low reliability) in each of the above categories is summarised in Table 3-1.

**Table 3-1 Results of initial reconciliation**

Category	High Reliability Water Share (ML)	Low Reliability Water Share (ML)
Confirmed but held in name of others	561.4	17.3
Details confirmed and in name of GMW	14,648.2	5,396.3
Difference in region recorded	19.6	179.6
Difference in region recorded and held in name of others	42.1	53.8
Difference in volume recorded (cancelled) and region recorded and held in name of others	47.4	0
Outside of Project Area	920	18.9
Difference in region recorded and held in name of others but insufficient evidence	118.5	0
Confirmed but held in name of others - insufficient evidence	2	0
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>16,359.2</b>	<b>5,665.9</b>

The variances in region between GMW records and the VWR were discussed with DEWLP and GMW Connections and the region assigned on the Victorian Water Register has been accepted by GMW Connections for the purposes of this audit. The allocation of WEEs to a particular region has an impact on the calculation of LTDLE as different conversion factors apply to each region. However, as the difference between these conversion factors is less than 2% for High-Reliability Water Shares (HRWS) and 17% for Low-Reliability Water Shares (LRWS) and the volumes over which there is a discrepancy is small, the impact on the audited LTDLE total is minor.

For seven of the WEEs claimed by GMW but recorded on the Register in the name of others, we have been provided with evidence supporting GMW's ownership of the Entitlement at previous audits. For the eight other WEEs (listed below in Table 3-2), GMW provided a signed Application Form for transferring ownership of the Entitlement to support its claim to ownership. Evidence of ownership, in the form of a "Form 1: Application for Approval to Transfer a Water Share" for each WEE held in the name of others, is included in an accompanying Summary Document to protect entitlement holders privacy.

It was also identified that GMW Connections had incorrectly included in its total a 51.3ML portion of a WEE that had been previously divided where it no longer had entitlement this portion.

In reviewing the documentation provided by GMW Connections to demonstrate its entitlement to WEEs held in the name of others, we identified:

- ▶ some forms were incomplete; and/or
- ▶ had alterations where the changes were not initialled by both parties to the transfer (seller and buyer).

The instances noted above have been identified in Table 3-2.

Table 3-2 details the differences observed identified between the WEEs claimed by GMW Connections and the Victorian Water Register as well as the resolutions implemented where required.

**Table 3-2 Investigation of observed variances between the Victorian Water Register and GMW records**

WEE	Volume (ML)		Issue Identified	Investigation findings/s	Resolution
	High	Low			
WEE003332	2		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE003450		111.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ GMW Connections record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> </ul>
WEE004293	234.2		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE005665	13		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE005666		5.8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE011859	26.5		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE011860		11.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE013814	118.5		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ GMW Connections record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region</li> <li>▪ Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> <li>▪ Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> <li>▪ Ownership by GMW verified however changes on form not initialled therefore deemed as insufficient evidence and removed from audited total.</li> </ul>
WEE013815		53.8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ GMW Connections record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> </ul>

WEE	Volume (ML)		Issue Identified	Investigation finding/s	Resolution
	High	Low			
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Register states Murray Region</li> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE016255	270.5		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE023553	90		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not in project area (Zone - 2 Broken)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not included in audited total as outside of project area.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Broken River Shares outside of scope</li> </ul>
WEE023554		18.9	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not in project area (Zone - 2 Broken)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not included in audited total as outside of project area.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Broken River Shares outside of scope</li> </ul>
WEE028998	30		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW Connections record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region</li> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> <li>Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> <li>Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE030444		68.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW Connections record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> </ul>
WEE031109	12.1		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW Connections record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region</li> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> <li>Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> <li>Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE031706	830		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not in project area (Zone - 2 Broken)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not included in audited total as outside of project area.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Broken River Shares outside of scope</li> </ul>
WEE046119	2.2		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE046417	47.4		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This WEE has been cancelled on the register (0 volume)</li> <li>Region incorrect (GMW Connections' record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region)</li> <li>Recorded owner not GMW but previously audited</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Accepted by GMW Connections as cancelled</li> <li>Evidence of ownership transfer sighted at previous audit</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cancelled, GMW not claiming 47.4ML HRWS</li> </ul>



WEE	Volume (ML)		Issue Identified	Investigation finding/s	Resolution
	High	Low			
WEE046467	19.6		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW Connections' record states Goulburn region, Victorian Water Register states Murray Region</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GMW agreed that VWR region correct</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Corrected in GMW Connections records from Goulburn to Murray</li> </ul>
WEE056853	13		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ownership by GMW verified</li> </ul>
WEE056854	2		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Victorian Water Register recorded owner is not GMW</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Evidence of GMW ownership transfer sighted however reliability (High/Low) on form not indicated (reliability confirmed via VWR) and deemed as insufficient evidence of ownership, therefore removed from audited total.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ownership by GMW verified however reliability (High/Low) on form not indicated (reliability confirmed via VWR) and deemed as insufficient evidence of ownership, therefore removed from audited total.</li> </ul>
WEE057056	6.5		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>VRW reported this WEE as cancelled on the register (0 volume)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This WEE was active as at 30 June 2015 (cancelled 9/7/2015) and to be included in the audited total</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Verified by DEWLP not cancelled as at 30 June 2015 and included in audited total</li> </ul>

Following resolution of the above noted differences, the impact of the adjustments to the audited total of WEE volumes due to the audit is exclusion of 1,087.9 ML of HRWS and 18.9 ML of LRWS.

Following resolution of the above noted differences, the impact of the adjustments to the audited total of WEE volumes due to the audit is a reduction of 1,087.9 ML of HRWS and 18.9 ML of LRWS.

Of these amounts:

- ▶ 47.4ML HRWS claimed as part of GMW Connections' Stage 1 project has been cancelled on the Victorian Water Register and therefore excluded from the total claim.
- ▶ 920ML HRWS and 18.9ML LRWS was not included because these were found to be in the Broken region. DELWP advised that shares from the Broken region cannot contribute to Stage 1 totals under the funding agreement. Of these shares, 830ML of HRWS relating to the Cosgrove project is held in trust by GMW for DELWP.
- ▶ 167.9ML HRWS claimed as part of GMW Connections' Stage 1 but ownership was unable to be verified and therefore not accepted.

We discuss in more detail the exclusion of WEEs due to lack of evidence in ownership in the following section.

### 3.1 Review of ownership evidence

As per the scope of this audit, GMW Connections was required to provide evidence of any WEEs that were recorded in the Victorian Water Register as at 30 June 2015 as not owned by GMW. To meet this requirement, GMW Connections provided relevant "Form 1 – Application for Approval to Transfer a Water Share" documentation as evidence of ownership that had been signed by seller and buyer.

The GMW Water Trading and Change of Ownership Team does not accept or process transfer forms that are incomplete or where changes have not been initialled by both the seller and buyer. Therefore, we have not

included these in the audited total. Table 3-3 lists the WEEs that cannot be included in GMW Connections' water recovery volume allocations due to insufficient evidence.

**Table 3-3 Insufficient Evidence of Ownership**

WEE	Application WET Number	Issue with Form	Volume		Region
			High Reliability (ML)	Low Reliability (ML)	
WEE013814	#WET509428	WEE and Volume are crossed out without initials or other evidence that this was sighted by all parties	118.5		Murray <i>(Note: GMW recorded as Goulburn prior to audit)</i>
WEE056854	#WET511910	High or low reliability not indicated on form. (Volume taken from spreadsheet record)	2.0		Goulburn

It was additionally noted that #WET511894 for WEE003332 had no indication ('yes' or 'no') for Section E, question (i.), "Are you buying the land with which the water share is currently associated".

Note that the 120.5ML of HRWS referred to in Table 3-3 are accounted for in the volumes excluded as set out in Section 3, they are not in addition to these volumes.

## 4 Calculation of long term diversion limit equivalent

Following confirmation of the WEEs held by GMW Connections as outlined above, the entitlement volumes have been converted into LTDLE volume in Table 4-1 using the conversion factors provided by DELWP.

Table 4-1 Calculation of Long Term Diversion Limit Equivalent

Project / Irrigation area	Volumes		Conversion factors		Long Term Diversion Equivalent		Total
	Low reliability	High reliability	Low reliability	High reliability	Accruing from low reliability	Accruing from high reliability	
	(ML)	(ML)	(ML share / ML LTDE)	(ML share / ML LTDE)	(ML)	(ML)	
<b>Stage 1 OFE</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>4397.4</b>			<b>0.00</b>	<b>4052.90</b>	
Goulburn	0	2719.2	0.546	0.927	0.00	2520.70	<b>2520.70</b>
Murray	0	1678.2	0.659	0.913	0.00	1532.20	<b>1532.20</b>
<b>Stage 1</b>	<b>5647.0</b>	<b>10232.9</b>			<b>3507.23</b>	<b>9386.55</b>	
Goulburn	1895.1	3136.8	0.546	0.927	1034.72	2907.81	<b>3942.54</b>
Murray	3751.9	7096.1	0.659	0.913	2472.50	6478.74	<b>8951.24</b>
<b>Total Stage 1 incl. OFE</b>							
Goulburn	1895.1	5856.0	0.546	0.927	1034.72	5428.51	<b>6463.24</b>
Murray	3751.9	8774.3	0.659	0.913	2472.50	8010.94	<b>10483.44</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>5647.0</b>	<b>14630.3</b>			<b>3507.23</b>	<b>13439.45</b>	<b>16946.67</b>
<b>Reconfiguration</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>641.0</b>			<b>0.00</b>	<b>585.88</b>	
Goulburn	0	46.3	0.546	0.927	0.00	42.92	<b>42.92</b>
Murray	0	594.7	0.659	0.913	0.00	542.96	<b>542.96</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>641.0</b>			<b>0</b>	<b>585.88</b>	<b>585.88</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,647.0</b>	<b>15,271.3</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>3,507.23</b>	<b>14,025.33</b>	<b>17,532.56</b>

## 5 Conclusions

Our audit of the WEEs claimed by GMW Connections for the Stage 1 project identified a number of issues in the recording of WEEs by GMW Connections that impacted on the final total. The differences between the WEEs put forward by GMW Connections and Victorian Water Register records included (not mutually exclusive):

- ▶ 15 WEEs where the owner recorded on the Victorian Water Register was not GMW. Of these:
  - Six of the WEEs were recorded on the Victorian Water Register in the name of others and GMW Connection provided evidence of ownership during this audit.
  - Six of the WEEs were recorded on the Victorian Water Register in the name of others and GMW Connections provided evidence of ownership during previous audits.
  - Two of the WEEs were recorded on the Victorian Water Register in the name of others and GMW Connections provided evidence of ownership during this audit however the transfer forms were deemed incomplete and insufficient evidence to claim ownership.
  - One of the WEEs was recorded on the Victorian Water Register in the name of others and GMW Connections provided evidence of ownership during a previous audit but has since been cancelled.
  - Copies of all transfer forms used as evidence of ownership are provided in an accompanying report.
- ▶ Eight WEEs where the region was recorded as Goulburn River system in GMW records, but was recorded as the Murray system by the Victorian Water Register. This was agreed to by GMW and to be changed in GMW Connections' records. It is noted that in the estimates of LTDLE volume held by GMW Connections the impact is minor.
- ▶ One WEE (WEE046417) of 47.4ML (HRWS on the Murray System) claimed by GMW Connections was not in the Victorian Water Register and not able to be claimed.

As per Table 3-2, these issues have been addressed and resolved to arrive at the audited figures.

### 5.1 Observations

The audit noted the following specific observations that may limit the reliability of GMW Connection's records:

- ▶ The GMW Connections register had some errors such as incorrect assignment of the source region for WEEs and one cancellation not recorded.
- ▶ The *Form 1: Applications for Approval to Transfer a Water Share* forms lodged with GMW Water Trading and Change of Ownership to transfer the ownership of WEEs (and used as evidence for ownership for the purpose of this audit):
  - appear incomplete in some instances (e.g. some sections incomplete, e.g. boxes of the form lacking ticks; one form did not indicate whether the allocation was high or low reliability)
  - have WEE numbers and volumes crossed out and corrected with no evidence that this was done with the seller's knowledge. The seller needs to initial any changes on the form before GMW can process these forms.
- ▶ GMW Connections did not have evidence of ownership of WEEs held in the name of others (i.e. completed copies of "Form 1 – Application for Approval to Transfer a Water Share") readily at hand.

## 5.2 Recommendations

We recommend that GMW Connections improves its processes for recording and reporting the transfer and movements of WEEs, as well as improving its processes for verifying the details of the WEEs it holds. Specific process improvements we propose be considered by GMW Connections are listed below:

- ▶ We recommend that GMW Connections undertakes an internal reconciliation of WEE details against the Victorian Water Register following the end of every financial year (recognising that the Victorian Water Register may close for a few days after the end of the financial year).
- ▶ We recommend that for *Applications for Approval to Transfer a Water Share* (WET) forms (the 'Form 1' submitted to GMW) GMW Connections undertakes the following:
  - Ensures that the date the form was completed is recorded
  - Ensures that the date the seller signed the form is recorded
  - Ensures that all changes to the contents of the form, particularly WEE numbers, account numbers, volumes, and reliability are to be initialled by both buyer and seller.
  - An internal audit of all ownership forms to ensure that they are completed in their entirety prior to submission.

Audit of Water  
Entitlement Purchases  
(GMW Connections)

APPENDIX A  
WEES CLAIMED BY  
GMW IN WATER  
SAVINGS  
CALCULATION



GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
Murray River	WEE000070	GMW	Stage 1	Low	1
Murray River	WEE000333	GMW	Stage 1	Low	28.8
Goulburn River	WEE000604	GMW	Stage 1	High	5
Murray River	WEE000658	GMW	Stage 1	High	1
Goulburn River	WEE000660	GMW	Stage 1	Low	158.4
Murray River	WEE001429	GMW	Stage 1	High	34.8
Murray River	WEE001603	GMW	Stage 1	Low	78.2
Goulburn River	WEE002024	GMW	Stage 1	Low	85.4
Goulburn River	WEE002116	GMW	Stage 1	High	12.8
Goulburn River	WEE002117	GMW	Stage 1	Low	0.5
Goulburn River	WEE002499	GMW	Stage 1	Low	42.7
Murray River	WEE002587	GMW	Stage 1	High	132.1
Murray River	WEE002588	GMW	Stage 1	Low	60
Murray River	WEE002793	GMW	Stage 1	High	7
Murray River	WEE002794	GMW	Stage 1	Low	2.9
Murray River	WEE003038	GMW	Stage 1	Low	25
Murray River	WEE003192	GMW	Stage 1	High	92.2
Murray River	WEE003193	GMW	Stage 1	Low	40.8
Goulburn River	WEE003332	Parked	Stage 1	High	2
Murray River	WEE003448	GMW	Stage 1	Low	26.9
Goulburn River	WEE003450	Parked	Stage 1	Low	111.4
Murray River	WEE003826	GMW	Stage 1	Low	15.4
Murray River	WEE003886	GMW	Stage 1	Low	9.6
Goulburn River	WEE004010	GMW	Stage 1	Low	36.5
Murray River	WEE004066	GMW	Stage 1	Low	42.7
Goulburn River	WEE004293	Parked	Stage 1	High	234.2
Goulburn River	WEE004375	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	1
Goulburn River	WEE004491	GMW	Stage 1	High	2.9
Goulburn River	WEE005301	GMW	Stage 1	Low	56.6
Goulburn River	WEE005456	GMW	Stage 1	Low	112.8
Goulburn River	WEE005458	GMW	Stage 1	Low	81.1
Goulburn River	WEE005485	GMW	Stage 1	Low	1
Goulburn River	WEE005665	Parked	Stage 1	High	13
Goulburn River	WEE005666	Parked	Stage 1	Low	5.8
Murray River	WEE005735	GMW	Stage 1	Low	177.1
Murray River	WEE005769	GMW	Stage 1	Low	1.9
Murray River	WEE006062	GMW	Stage 1	Low	60.5

GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
Goulburn River	WEE006173	GMW	Stage 1	Low	61.4
Murray River	WEE006364	GMW	Stage 1	Low	10.6
Goulburn River	WEE006477	GMW	Stage 1	Low	21.1
Murray River	WEE006789	GMW	Stage 1	Low	2.9
Goulburn River	WEE006962	GMW	Stage 1	High	21.1
Goulburn River	WEE006963	GMW	Stage 1	Low	9.6
Murray River	WEE006986	GMW	Stage 1	High	2
Murray River	WEE006987	GMW	Stage 1	Low	1
Murray River	WEE007103	GMW	Stage 1	Low	52.3
Murray River	WEE007308	GMW	Stage 1	High	5
Murray River	WEE007309	GMW	Stage 1	Low	1.9
Goulburn River	WEE007439	GMW	Stage 1	Low	104.2
Murray River	WEE007803	GMW	Stage 1	High	118.4
Murray River	WEE007804	GMW	Stage 1	Low	53.8
Goulburn River	WEE008211	GMW	Stage 1	Low	9.1
Murray River	WEE008479	GMW	Stage 1	High	29.6
Murray River	WEE008480	GMW	Stage 1	Low	13.4
Murray River	WEE008496	GMW	Stage 1	Low	43.7
Goulburn River	WEE008625	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	16
Murray River	WEE008883	GMW	Stage 1	High	309.2
Murray River	WEE008884	GMW	Stage 1	High	161
Murray River	WEE009159	GMW	Stage 1	Low	12
Murray River	WEE009379	GMW	Stage 1	High	36.1
Murray River	WEE009380	GMW	Stage 1	Low	16.3
Murray River	WEE009619	GMW	Stage 1	High	83.3
Murray River	WEE009620	GMW	Stage 1	Low	37.9
Goulburn River	WEE009629	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	1
Goulburn River	WEE010074	GMW	Stage 1	High	63.2
Murray River	WEE010266	GMW	Stage 1	High	63
Murray River	WEE010267	GMW	Stage 1	Low	23
Murray River	WEE010590	GMW	Stage 1	High	10.8
Murray River	WEE010676	GMW	Stage 1	High	315.5
Murray River	WEE010677	GMW	Stage 1	Low	143.5
Murray River	WEE010763	GMW	Stage 1	Low	3.4
Murray River	WEE010931	GMW	Stage 1	Low	9.6
Murray River	WEE011076	GMW	Stage 1	Low	20.2
Goulburn River	WEE011172	GMW	Stage 1	High	188.5
Goulburn River	WEE011173	GMW	Stage 1	Low	84.5



GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
Murray River	WEE011503	GMW	Stage 1	High	102.5
Murray River	WEE011504	GMW	Stage 1	Low	46.6
Goulburn River	WEE011586	GMW	Stage 1	High	3
Goulburn River	WEE011613	GMW	Stage 1	High	152.4
Goulburn River	WEE011614	GMW	Stage 1	Low	68.2
Goulburn River	WEE011634	GMW	Stage 1	Low	0.5
Goulburn River	WEE011859	Parked	Stage 1	High	26.5
Goulburn River	WEE011860	Parked	Stage 1	Low	11.5
Murray River	WEE011919	GMW	Stage 1	High	90.3
Murray River	WEE011920	GMW	Stage 1	Low	40.3
Murray River	WEE011935	GMW	Stage 1	High	131
Murray River	WEE011950	GMW	Stage 1	Low	106.1
Goulburn River	WEE012419	GMW	Stage 1	Low	11.5
Murray River	WEE012646	GMW	Stage 1	Low	39.4
Murray River	WEE012652	GMW	Stage 1	Low	54.2
Goulburn River	WEE012657	GMW	Stage 1	High	449.5
Goulburn River	WEE013094	GMW	Stage 1	High	86
Goulburn River	WEE013095	GMW	Stage 1	Low	38.4
Goulburn River	WEE013357	GMW	Stage 1	Low	287
Murray River	WEE013417	GMW	Stage 1	High	226.2
Murray River	WEE013418	GMW	Stage 1	Low	105.1
Murray River	WEE013482	GMW	Stage 1	Low	45.1
Murray River	WEE013556	GMW	Stage 1	Low	56.6
Murray River	WEE013754	GMW	Stage 1	High	141.6
Murray River	WEE013755	GMW	Stage 1	Low	64.3
Goulburn River	WEE013814	Parked	Stage 1	High	118.5
Goulburn River	WEE013815	Parked	Stage 1	Low	53.8
Goulburn River	WEE014583	GMW	Stage 1	Low	58.1
Murray River	WEE014752	GMW	Stage 1	Low	18.2
Murray River	WEE016255	Parked	Stage1	High	270.5
Murray River	WEE016327	GMW	Stage 1	Low	26.9
Murray River	WEE016791	GMW	Stage 1	Low	70.1
Goulburn River	WEE016827	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	11.7
Goulburn River	WEE016856	GMW	Stage 1	Low	84.5
Murray River	WEE020784	GMW	Stage 1	Low	56.2
Murray River	WEE021963	GMW	Stage 1	High	1
Goulburn River	WEE022539	GMW	Stage 1	High	2
2 Broken	WEE023553	GMW	Stage 1	High	90

GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
2 Broken	WEE023554	GMW	Stage 1	Low	18.9
Murray River	WEE024092	GMW	Stage 1	Low	50.9
Murray River	WEE024473	GMW	Stage 1	Low	55.2
Goulburn River	WEE024671	GMW	Stage 1	High	196.3
Goulburn River	WEE024672	GMW	Stage 1	Low	88.3
Murray River	WEE025433	GMW	Stage 1	Low	49.4
Murray River	WEE027059	GMW	Stage 1	Low	38.9
Murray River	WEE027121	GMW	Stage 1	High	244.9
Murray River	WEE027122	GMW	Stage 1	Low	111.8
Murray River	WEE027542	GMW	Stage 1	Low	21.6
Murray River	WEE028063	GMW	Stage 1	High	48.9
Murray River	WEE028064	GMW	Stage 1	Low	21.6
Murray River	WEE028096	GMW	Stage 1	Low	112.8
Goulburn River	WEE028099	GMW	Stage 1	High	6.9
Goulburn River	WEE028101	GMW	Stage 1	High	359.6
Murray River	WEE028520	GMW	Stage 1	Low	14.4
Murray River	WEE028522	GMW	Stage 1	Low	111.4
Goulburn River	WEE028998	Parked	Stage 1	High	30
Murray River	WEE028999	GMW	Stage 1	Low	9.6
Goulburn River	WEE029674	GMW	Stage 1	High	57
Goulburn River	WEE029675	GMW	Stage 1	Low	24
Goulburn River	WEE030444	Parked	Stage 1	Low	68.2
Goulburn River	WEE030596	GMW	Stage 1	High	124.4
Murray River	WEE031071	GMW	Stage 1	Low	201.1
Goulburn River	WEE031109	Parked	Stage 1	High	12.1
2 Broken	WEE031706	GMW	Special Project	High	830
Murray River	WEE034800	GMW	Stage 1	High	4
Murray River	WEE034877	GMW	Stage 1	Low	59
Murray River	WEE035568	GMW	Stage 1	Low	7.2
Murray River	WEE036172	GMW	Stage 1	High	12.5
Murray River	WEE036174	GMW	Stage 1	High	162.5
Murray River	WEE037267	GMW	Stage 1	High	2.1
Goulburn River	WEE039164	GMW	Stage 1	High	7.6
Murray River	WEE042969	GMW	Stage 1	High	100.5
Murray River	WEE043001	GMW	Stage 1	High	270
Goulburn River	WEE043302	GMW	Stage 1	Low	39.4
Murray River	WEE045455	GMW	Stage 1	High	40.1
Goulburn River	WEE046119	Parked	Stage 1	High	2.2

GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
Goulburn River	WEE046417	Parked	Stage 1	High	47.4
Goulburn River	WEE046467	Parked	Stage 1	High	19.6
Murray River	WEE047639	GMW	Stage 1	High	18
Goulburn River	WEE047844	GMW	Stage 1	High	20
Goulburn River	WEE047846	GMW	Stage 1	High	20
Murray River	WEE048037	GMW	Stage 1	Low	13
Murray River	WEE048488	GMW	Stage 1	High	52
Murray River	WEE048492	GMW	Stage 1	High	44.6
Goulburn River	WEE048902	GMW	Stage 1	High	250
Murray River	WEE048963	GMW	Stage 1	High	77.5
Goulburn River	WEE049877	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	5.2
Murray River	WEE050632	GMW	OFE	High	98
Murray River	WEE050689	GMW	OFE	High	71
Goulburn River	WEE050769	GMW	OFE	High	46
Goulburn River	WEE050876	GMW	Stage 1	High	16
Murray River	WEE050931	GMW	Stage 1	High	58.5
Murray River	WEE050997	GMW	OFE	High	45
Goulburn River	WEE051040	GMW	Stage 1	High	1.4
Murray River	WEE051087	GMW	OFE	High	49
Murray River	WEE051094	GMW	Stage 1	High	2
Murray River	WEE051096	GMW	Stage 1	High	72.7
Murray River	WEE051192	GMW	Stage 1	High	7.5
Murray River	WEE051268	GMW	Stage 1	Low	39.9
Murray River	WEE051298	GMW	Stage 1	High	53
Goulburn River	WEE051302	GMW	Stage 1	High	2.1
Goulburn River	WEE051411	GMW	OFE	High	137
Goulburn River	WEE051568	GMW	OFE	High	40
Goulburn River	WEE051621	GMW	Stage 1	High	50
Murray River	WEE051630	GMW	Stage 1	Low	30
Murray River	WEE051720	GMW	Stage 1	Low	144
Goulburn River	WEE051827	GMW	Stage 1	High	189.4
Murray River	WEE051868	GMW	Stage 1	High	205.2
Murray River	WEE051868	Parked	Stage 1	High	51.3
Goulburn River	WEE052188	GMW	Stage 1	Low	213
Goulburn River	WEE052384	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	11.4
Goulburn River	WEE052462	GMW	Stage 1	High	1
Goulburn River	WEE052638	GMW	Stage 1	High	2.4
Goulburn River	WEE053348	GMW	Stage 1	High	28

GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
Goulburn River	WEE053943	GMW	Stage 1	High	49
Goulburn River	WEE054474	GMW	Stage 1	High	12.7
Goulburn River	WEE055333	GMW	Stage 1	High	230
Murray River	WEE055607	GMW	Stage 1	High	98.1
Murray River	WEE055748	GMW	Stage 1	Low	1.2
Murray River	WEE056753	GMW	Stage 1	Low	379.3
Murray River	WEE056754	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	552.7
Goulburn River	WEE056853	Parked	Stage 1	High	13
Goulburn River	WEE056854	Parked	Stage 1	High	2
Murray River	WEE057037	GMW	Stage 1	High	12
Murray River	WEE057039	GMW	Stage 1	High	124.3
Murray River	WEE057043	GMW	Stage 1	High	91.1
Murray River	WEE057044	GMW	Stage 1	High	3
Murray River	WEE057045	GMW	Stage 1	High	121.1
Murray River	WEE057047	GMW	Stage 1	High	51.9
Murray River	WEE057052	GMW	Stage 1	High	57.4
Murray River	WEE057056	GMW	Stage 1	High	6.5
Goulburn River	WEE057058	GMW	Stage 1	High	200
Goulburn River	WEE057060	GMW	Stage 1	Low	100
Murray River	WEE057099	GMW	Stage 1	High	166.8
Murray River	WEE057125	GMW	Stage 1	High	39
Murray River	WEE057127	GMW	Stage 1	High	108.6
Murray River	WEE057129	GMW	Stage 1	High	21.7
Murray River	WEE057145	GMW	Stage 1	High	19.8
Murray River	WEE057147	GMW	Stage 1	High	103.8
Murray River	WEE057149	GMW	Stage 1	High	3
Murray River	WEE057153	GMW	Stage 1	High	20.2
Murray River	WEE057177	GMW	Stage 1	High	300
Murray River	WEE057181	GMW	Stage 1	High	5
Murray River	WEE057193	GMW	Stage 1	High	29.8
Murray River	WEE057195	GMW	Stage 1	High	81.6
Murray River	WEE057201	GMW	Stage 1	High	208.5
Murray River	WEE057214	GMW	Stage 1	High	19.7
Murray River	WEE057235	GMW	Stage 1	High	146.8
Murray River	WEE057239	GMW	Stage 1	High	3
Murray River	WEE057241	GMW	Stage 1	High	32.1
Murray River	WEE057247	GMW	Stage 1	High	153.3
Murray River	WEE057251	GMW	Stage 1	High	110.4

GM-W assign region	WEE	In the name of	Budget Line	Reliability WEE	Total Volume ML WEE
Murray River	WEE057253	GMW	Stage 1	High	91.2
Murray River	WEE057291	GMW	Stage 1	High	61.1
Murray River	WEE057330	GMW	OFE	High	615
Murray River	WEE057409	GMW	OFE	High	800.2
Goulburn River	WEE057413	GMW	OFE	High	2496.2
Murray River	WEE057579	GMW	Stage 1	High	55
Murray River	WEE057585	GMW	Stage 1	High	2.5
Murray River	WEE057729	GMW	Stage 1	High	107.2
Murray River	WEE057731	GMW	Stage 1	High	4
Murray River	WEE057925	GMW	Stage 1	High	165
Murray River	WEE058666	GMW	Stage 1	High	50
Murray River	WEE058667	GMW	Stage 1	High	50
Murray River	WEE058668	GMW	Stage 1	High	46.6
Goulburn River	WEE058778	GMW	Stage 1	High	17.6
Murray River	WEE058977	GMW	Reconfiguration	High	42
Murray River	WEE059553	GMW	Stage 1	Low	300.8
Goulburn River	WEE059557	GMW	Stage 1	High	0.9
Murray River	WEE059558	GMW	Stage 1	High	3
Murray River	WEE059896	GMW	Stage 1	High	151.4
Murray River	WEE059900	GMW	Stage 1	High	130.2
Murray River	WEE059902	GMW	Stage 1	High	39.2
Goulburn River	WEE060113	GMW	Stage 1	High	17.2
Murray River	WEE060126	GMW	Stage 1	High	2
Murray River	WEE060861	GMW	Stage 1	High	96.9